

**Office of the Comptroller
Dutchess County**

22 MARKET STREET

POUGHKEEPSIE, N.Y. 12601

(845) 486-2050

FAX (845) 486-2055

E-MAIL: comptroller@co.dutchess.ny.us

James L. Coughlan
Comptroller

Peter J. Stalteri
Deputy Comptroller

Special Report to the Legislature
Mass Transit 2012 Budget

Comptroller's Review ET 5680 - Mass Transit

Scope

- ❖ Identify potential cost savings for Mass Transit's Recommended budget as shown in the Dutchess County 2012 Tentative Budget
- ❖ Identify additional savings based on Personnel Costs for 2011-2012
- ❖ Identify anticipated 2011 Personnel Cost savings

2012 Budget Recommendation:

A total of \$331,399 should be reduced from appropriations.

A total of \$331,399 is identified as potential over budgeting based on a three year trend of expenditures, 2009-2011 (to date). The lines which appear to have obvious variances (see pages 330-333, Dutchess County 2012 Tentative Budget):

Review of 2012 Tentative Budget					
Line	Description	2012 Tentative	Comptroller's Recommendation	Savings	Comment
4105	Bldg & Maint Parts, Supp & Tools	\$4,000	\$3,000	\$1,000	2009 - \$3,092 2010 - \$3,125 2011 - Expenses Year to date (10 mths) amounted to \$1,358
4431	Education Programs	\$1,000	\$400	\$600	2009 - \$158 2010 - \$317 2011 - Expenses Year to date (10 mths) amounted to \$0
4570	Rnt/Lease - Equip	\$31,000	\$1,000	\$30,000	2009 - \$1,186 2010 - \$923 2011 - Expenses Year to date (10 mths) amounted to \$388
4612	Repairs/Alt To Equip	\$107,500	\$95,000	\$12,500	2009 - \$122,455 2010 - \$89,683 2011 - Expenses Year to date (10 mths) amounted to \$37,813
4401	Professional Services	\$3,438,466	\$3,163,167	\$275,299	Management fees \$ 168,167
					Salary Costs <u>\$2,995,000</u>
					Total <u>\$3,163,167</u>
4613	Repairs to Real Prop	\$22,500	\$12,000	\$10,500	2009 - \$11,665 2010 - \$11,038 2011 - Expenses Year to date (10 mths) amounted to \$7,095
4654	Reimb of Exp Non-Employee	\$2,500	\$1,000	\$1,500	2009 - \$179 2010 - \$895 2011 - Expenses Year to date (10 mths) amounted to \$1,132
Total		\$3,606,966	\$3,275,567	\$331,399	

Please note our recommendation for line 4401 does not include the elimination of staffing

Observations

While the Division has reported cost savings and staffing reorganization, funding requests were not reduced to acknowledge these savings. Excerpts regarding staffing in the Dutchess County 2012 Tentative Executive Budget (page 217) Mass Transit follow:

- *In 2011, staff reorganization continued. Further staff changes have resulted in a more productive operations department.*
- *In 2011, overtime was reduced by more than \$100,000 through efficient scheduling of drivers.*

Management and Administrative Costs

Personnel Costs for operating the Mass Transit System are budgeted in ET5680 and identified as follows:

1. 1010 Positions – One County Transit Administrator - 2012 Cost \$124,084 (Salary and Benefits)
2. 4401.105 Professional Services Consultants - Management Services Contract (General Manager/Management Company) – 2012 Cost \$168,167
3. 4401.106 Professional services, program costs – **Salary only** - management company employees (includes: management, clerical, dispatchers, drivers, mechanics, etc.) Per the management contract “*All personnel costs shall be subject to the approval of the County.*”

Note: Non-employee benefits are budgeted in appropriation line 4755.

Observations

- In the adopted 2009 County Budget, a county position, County Transit Administrator, was added to the Division of Mass Transit’s budget “to maintain stable leadership and consistent oversight for the Division of Mass Transit.”
- The Professional Services Management Contract includes the general manager’s salary and central management by First Transit, Inc.
- A summary of positions billed by the Contractor and paid by the County is included in Exhibit I for 2010 and 2011.
 - In addition to the County Transit Administrator and the General Manager, there are 8 administrative positions: 6 managers, 1 supervisor and 1 administrator. In addition, there are 2 administrative assistant positions (one position is hourly – nonunion and one position is full time - union).

- As shown in Exhibit I, other positions are contractual and include call center, bus/van operators, mechanics, three clerks, maintenance.
- It appears the Personnel/Payroll Administrator position was created to combine functions attributed to the position of Customer Service/Human Resource Manager and the Payroll/Benefits Administrator.

Finding:

- Management and Administration costs for Mass Transit operations and supervision remain high. Responsibilities and duties should be reviewed to find operating and cost efficiencies.

Recommendation:

- The Department of Planning and Community Development, the overseer of this budget, should explore additional cost savings with the Transit Administrator and the Management Company. Administrative functions should be analyzed for duplicative efforts and cost efficiencies.

2011 Payroll Cost Savings

For 2011, a total of \$346,204 is estimated to be in excess; primarily, a result of over-budgeting personnel expense lines in 2011. Detail follows:

Acct	Description	2011 Adopted Budget	2011 Projected Expenses *	2011 Adopted vs. Projected Expenses
4401.105	Professional Services Consultant	\$161,699	\$163,194	(\$1,495)
4401.106	Professional Services Program	\$3,267,799	\$2,920,100	\$347,699
Total		\$3,429,498	\$3,083,294	\$346,204

* Projected expenses reflect 46 weeks actual expenses and 6 weeks projected based on a 52 week average.

EXHIBIT I

Data provided by Mass Transit

Position Roster as of Dates Indicated - Note: Some positions may be vacant

DEPARTMENT/JOB TITLE As of Week Ending October 29, 2010		HRLY RATE Van Rate for Bus Operators	HRLY RATE 2 Coach Rate for Bus Operators	DEPARTMENT/JOB TITLE As of Week Ending October 28, 2011		HRLY RATE Van Rate for Bus Operators	HRLY RATE 2 Coach Rate for Bus Operators
#				#			
Admin Salary - Dept 1000				Admin Salary - Dept 1000			
Administrative Supervisor	1	\$20.460		Office Manager	1	\$22.097	
Assistant General Manager	1	\$34.090		Assistant General Manager	1	\$34.090	
Customer Service/HR Manager	1	\$27.610		Maintenance Manager	1	\$25.750	
Maintenance Manager	1	\$25.750		Operations Manager	1	\$24.038	
Operations Manager	1	\$24.038		Operations Supervisor	1	\$19.712	
Operations Supervisor	1	\$22.241		Assistant Operations Manager	1	\$21.635	
Operations Supervisor Data	1	\$19.712		Personnel/Payroll Administrator	1	\$20.433	
Payroll/Benefits Administrator	1	\$20.433		Procurement Manager	1	\$22.800	
Procurement Manager	1	\$22.800		Admin Hrly - Dept 2000			
Admin Hrly - Non-Union - Dept 2000				Admin Hrly - Dept 2000			
Data Clerk	1	\$15.210		Data Clerk	1	\$15.210	
Data Clerk	1	\$17.100		Data Clerk	1	\$17.100	
Maintenance Administrative Assistant	1	\$15.290		Maintenance Administrative Assistant	1	\$15.290	
Operations Clerk	1	\$14.760		Operations Clerk	1	\$14.760	
Operations Clerk	1	\$15.450		Call Center - Dept 3000			
Administrative Assistant - PART TIME	1	\$14.000		Call Center - Dept 3000			
Call Center - Dept 3000				Call Center - Dept 3000			
Customer Service Dispatch Representative	2	\$17.500		Customer Service Dispatch Representative	2	\$17.500	
Office Hrly Non-Union - Dept 4000 (established 2011)				Office Hrly Non-Union - Dept 4000			
Office Hrly Non-Union - Dept 4000 (established 2011)				Office Hrly Non-Union - Dept 4000			
Coach Bus Operators - Dept 5000				Coach Bus Operators - Dept 5000			
Coach Bus Operators - Dept 5000				Coach Bus Operators - Dept 5000			
Van Bus Operators - Dept 6000				Van Bus Operators - Dept 6000			
Van Bus Operators - Dept 6000				Van Bus Operators - Dept 6000			
Bus Operator	11		\$19.920	Bus Operator	9		\$19.920
Bus Operator	28	\$18.870	\$19.920	Bus Operator	28	\$18.870	\$19.920
Bus Operator				Bus Operator	4	\$16.040	\$16.930
Maintenance - Mechanics - Dept 7000				Maintenance - Mechanics - Dept 7000			
Maintenance - Mechanics - Dept 7000				Maintenance - Mechanics - Dept 7000			
Crew Lead	1	\$22.450		Crew Lead	1	\$22.450	
Mechanic A	1	\$21.410		Mechanic A	1	\$21.410	
Mechanic B	2	\$20.500		Mechanic B	2	\$20.500	
Mechanic C	3	\$19.770		Mechanic C	2	\$19.770	
Maintenance - Utility - Dept 8000				Maintenance - Utility - Dept 8000			
Maintenance - Utility - Dept 8000				Maintenance - Utility - Dept 8000			
Utility A	4	\$18.750		Utility A	4	\$18.750	
Bus Operators - Part Time - Dept 1200				Bus Operators - Part Time - Dept 1200			
Bus Operators - Part Time - Dept 1200				Bus Operators - Part Time - Dept 1200			
Bus Operator - Part Time	3	\$15.000		Bus Operator - Part Time	1	\$15.000	
TOTAL	70			TOTAL	67		

EXHIBIT II

Mass Transit Payroll Disbursements - 2010	Beginning W/E 01/01/10		Ending W/E 12/31/10		Average 53 weeks	
	# of Employees	Salary	# of Employees	Salary	# of Employees	Salary
	1000 - Administration	8	\$7,821.20	8	\$7,646.43	8
2000 - Clerical	5	\$3,152.47	6	\$3,445.49	5	\$3,247.44
3000 - Dispatcher	2	\$757.75	2	\$1,964.38	3	\$1,544.92
5000 - Driver-Coach	10	\$8,843.31	11	\$9,940.09	10	\$8,418.98
6000 - Driver-Van	29	\$23,346.47	27	\$23,934.19	30	\$26,008.57
7000 - Mechanic	8	\$5,732.00	6	\$6,751.91	6	\$5,616.60
8000 - Utility A (Bus Washers)	4	\$3,052.00	4	\$3,683.44	4	\$3,019.50
12000 - Driver-PT	2	\$273.00	3	\$989.25	3	\$674.25
Bonus						\$427.55
Payroll Taxes						\$5,019.82
Totals	68	\$52,978.20	67	\$58,355.18	68	\$61,191.38

* Department 12000 - Driver PT 20 weeks only. Beginning W/E 08/10/2010

Mass Transit Payroll Disbursements - 2011	Beginning W/E 01/07/11		Ending W/E 10/28/11		Average 43 weeks	
	# of Employees	Salary	# of Employees	Salary	# of Employees	Salary
	1000 - Administration	8	\$7,646.41	8	\$7,622.19	7.7
2000 - Clerical	6	\$3,571.91	4	\$2,514.14	5.5	\$3,340.11
3000 - Dispatcher	2	\$1,400.00	2	\$1,410.51	2.0	\$1,469.98
4000 - Admin-Hrly	1	\$672.73	1	\$665.63	0.4	\$249.20
5000 - Driver-Coach	11	\$8,855.43	8	\$7,124.37	9.5	\$7,948.52
6000 - Driver-Van	28	\$21,246.39	29	\$23,673.88	28.7	\$22,717.32
7000 - Mechanic	7	\$4,936.43	5	\$4,522.91	5.4	\$4,671.34
8000 - Utility A (Bus Washers)	4	\$3,075.00	3	\$2,311.88	3.9	\$3,078.90
12000 - Driver-PT	3	\$309.00	1	\$216.00	1.5	\$269.42
Bonus						\$125.47
Payroll Taxes						\$4,705.21
Totals	70	\$51,713.30	61	\$50,061.51	64.6	\$56,008.01

* Department 4000 - Admin - Hrly 6 weeks only. Beginning W/E 07/15/2011

** Department 12000 - Driver PT 30 weeks only. Three weeks without part time hours worked.